

Acton Edward Prof (VCO)

From: ALASTAIRMUIR RUSSELL [REDACTED]
Sent: 02 December 2009 09:02
To: Acton Edward Prof (VCO)
Subject: RE: CRU Review at UEA

Edward *[Information exempted pursuant to s.40(2), Freedom of Information Act]*

I have thought quite carefully about the proposed Review and am prepared to contemplate leading it, but that is subject to a number of points that we would need to agree in advance.

1. I would want to be described as leading a review team. I am quite clear that this will require a range of expertise and authority that no single individual will have. For example, it will be necessary to understand the issues relevant to the handling of research data, relevant statistical issues, and the relevant background of climate science, as well as how data is held and transmitted securely. The people we assemble need to have obvious authority and trust.
2. There is a danger that an announcement before the shape of the team is settled would go off at half cock. We don't want this to look like a quick whitewash job.
3. There may be some interests whose support for this approach to a review should be sought in advance - eg Research Councils UK, Government, and also opinion leaders like Dave King - and that could take a few days.
4. The work required could be quite extensive, to produce a report with authority, so your timescale might be difficult to meet in terms of a complete final report.
5. I have no clear idea of the number of days' work that would be required, but could find 15-20 days including reading and writing time between now and 19 February.

We would need to discuss fees etc. Reflecting my salary in my last job I would expect to charge something in the region of £1500 per day, plus travel and accommodation, given that administrative support would be provided by UEA.

All that said, I find involvement in this attractive. I would welcome the opportunity to discuss and will arrange to give you a call this evening, probably around 10 pm if that is convenient.

Muir

--- On Tue, 1/12/09, Acton Edward Prof (VCO) <E.Acton@uea.ac.uk> wrote:

From: Acton Edward Prof (VCO) <E.Acton@uea.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: CRU Review at UEA
To: "ALASTAIRMUIR RUSSELL" <[REDACTED]>
Date: Tuesday, 1 December, 2009, 9:05

Dear Muir

Admirable. My thought is to announce the Independent Review on Friday if at all possible.

Best wishes *[Information exempted pursuant to s.40(2), Freedom of Information Act]*

Edward

From: ALASTAIRMUIR RUSSELL [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday, December 01, 2009 8:57 AM
To: Acton Edward Prof (VCO)
Subject: Re: CRU Review at UEA

Edward *[Information exempted pursuant to s.40(2), Freedom of Information Act]*

just to confirm I have your e-mail.. I am chairing an interview panel all day, and will aim to get back to you this evening..

Muir

--- On Mon, 30/11/09, Acton Edward Prof (VCO) <E.Acton@uea.ac.uk> wrote:

From: Acton Edward Prof (VCO) <E.Acton@uea.ac.uk>
Subject: CRU Review at UEA
To: [REDACTED]
Date: Monday, 30 November, 2009, 17:32

Dear Muir, if I may *[Information exempted pursuant to s.40(2), Freedom of Information Act]*

I attach the Draft Terms of Reference. I very much look forward to your thinking. My mobile number, should you be ringing later on this evening is:

07917085097

Best wishes

Edward

Professor Edward Acton
Vice-Chancellor
University of East Anglia
Norwich
NR4 7TJ

PA: Jacqui Churchill
Email: j.churchill@uea.ac.uk
Telephone: 01603 592206

UEA launch an Independent Review into the Climatic Research Unit (CRU)

Background

On Wednesday 18 November, a substantial file, including over 1000 emails either sent from or sent to members of the Climatic Research Unit ("CRU") at the University of East Anglia, was downloaded on the RealClimate website, together with meteorological station data used for research by CRU into the rate of the earth's warming, particularly over the past 150 years and other material.

The information subsequently appeared on a significant number of other sites. UEA has at this stage no way of knowing how many files were stolen. The earliest e-mail which has appeared so far was dated March 1996 so potentially 13 years worth of e-mails have been stolen. The material concerned is thought to have been accessed illegally from a back-up server in CRU and the police are investigating the matter.

The Allegations

The CRU emails have been the subject of considerable comment both in the mainstream press, and on the internet. The contents of a small sub-set of the emails have been alleged to evidence a series of inappropriate actions attributable to Professor Phil Jones, the Director of CRU.

The main allegations are as follows:

1. the manipulation of climate data (potentially to overstate increases in global temperatures);
2. an intention (or attempt) to manipulate the peer review system to prevent the publication of research which might counter the presumption of unprecedented global warming;
3. withholding or attempting to withhold information illegally under the terms of the Freedom of Information Act ("the FOIA") or the Environmental Information Regulations ("the EIR"); including the deletion of emails between scientists contributing to the International Panel on Climate Change (IPCC);
4. the lack of availability and transparency of data held by the CRU.

5. an unreasonable or unusual reluctance to have the research questioned or tested by others, who may have a different view, albeit always subjected to peer review.

The wording of some of the emails were both inappropriate and offensive. Professor Jones accepts full responsibility for this and has already issued an apology (on Tuesday 24 November).

The Independent Review

An independent review of CRU will now take place to address the key accusations which arise from the leaked e-mails.

The review will:

1. examine both the leaked e-mail exchanges, other relevant e-mail exchanges and any other information held at CRU to determine whether there is any evidence of the manipulation or suppression of data which is at odds with acceptable scientific practice and call into question any of the research outcomes;
2. review CRU's policies and practices for acquiring, assembling, subjecting to peer review and disseminating data and research findings and their compliance or otherwise with best scientific practice;
3. review CRU's compliance or otherwise with the University's policies and practices regarding requests under the FOIA and EIR for the release of data.
4. review and make recommendations as to the appropriate management, governance and security structures for CRU which will ensure the security, integrity and release of the data it holds.

The Independent Reviewer will have the discretion to amend or add to the terms of reference if he feels necessary in order to investigate the accusations fully.

Independent Reviewer

A highly respected and authoritative VC.

Support to the Review

The Review will:

- be provided with appropriate administrative support;
- seek independent expert opinion where necessary;
- have access to and the full collaboration of all University staff.

Process

The Independent Reviewer will determine his own methods of working.

Timing

The Independent Reviewer has been asked to complete his work no later than 19 February 2010.

The Independent Reviewer will be able to determine whether or not he produces an interim report before the final report and extend the deadline if he deems absolutely necessary.

Recommendations

The recommendations of the Review will be made to the Vice-Chancellor who will report, with his response, to the Council of the University.

The final report and the University's response will be made public.